LAW OFFICE OF ROBERT W. KAYLOR, P.A.

353 EAST SIX FORKS ROAD, SUITE 260 RALEIGH, NORTH CAROLINA 27609 (919) 828-5250 FACSIMILE (919) 828-5240

June 24, 2022

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Ms. A. Shonta Dunston Chief Clerk North Carolina Utilities Commission 4325 Mail Service Center Raleigh, NC 27699-4300

RE: Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC Motion to Dismiss Complaint

Docket No. E-7, Sub 1270

Dear Ms. Dunston:

Enclosed for filing in the above-referenced docket, please find Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC's Motion to Dismiss Complaint.

Sincerely,

Robert W. Kaylor, P.A.

Robert W. Koyla

Enclosures

cc: Rhett Tabor

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA UTILITIES COMMISSION RALEIGH

DOCKET NO. E-7, SUB 1270

BEFORE THE NORTH CAROLINA UTILITIES COMMISSION

In the Matter of)
Rhett Tabor, 2028 Fairview Ro North Carolina 27608	oad, Raleigh,)))
	G 1:	DUKE ENERGY CAROLINAS,
	Complainant) LLC'S MOTION TO DISMISS COMPLAINT
v.)
Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC		
	Respondent)

NOW COMES Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC (hereinafter "Duke Energy Carolinas," "DEC" or the "Company") and respectfully moves the North Carolina Utilities Commission ("NCUC" or the "Commission") to dismiss the Complaint of Rhett Tabor ("Complainant") for the reasons as set forth below:

- 1. DEC moves the Commission to dismiss the Complaint on the grounds that Complainant has failed to state a claim upon which relief can be granted.
- 2. It is clear from the Complaint that Complainant's issue is a property matter and not a complaint about DEC's rates, tariffs, billing, or quality of service. The Commission ruled in *Gerringer v. Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC*, Docket No. E-7, Sub 907, that it had no jurisdiction over right-of-way agreements, and in *Root v. Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC*, Docket No. E-7, Sub 865, the Commission held that there was no indication that the Commission has jurisdiction over private agreements between a utility

and third parties such as right-of-way agreements. Also, in *Hardin v. Progress Energy, Inc.*, Docket No. E-2, Sub 984, the Commission ruled that it lacked subject matter jurisdiction over complaints made against public utilities that raise issues as to property rights.

3. Complainant alleges that "Duke Power and NCDOT trespassed on our property and ran the disputed power lines. Neither Duke nor NCDOT have an easement nor have paid us for this trespass." Exhibit "A" attached hereto establishes that the North Carolina Department of Transportation ("NCDOT") filed a Complaint and Declaration of Taking for condemnation under G.S. § 136-103 et seq. in Henderson County on July 16, 2019. Under G.S. § 136-104, the filing by NCDOT vested title in the area being condemned and is the property described by Complainant in this Complaint. Accordingly, DEC's power lines and poles complained of by Complainant are not on property owned by Complainant but are on an easement provided to DEC by NCDOT for relocating DEC facilities due to NCDOT's widening the Asheville Highway, also known as Interstate 26, in Henderson, North Carolina. The relocation work commenced on February 25, 2020. Exhibit "B" attached hereto establishes that the poles and lines installed by DEC are located on the NCDOT easement and not on any property owned by Complainant.

WHEREFORE, for the reasons set forth above, Respondent Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC moves the Commission to dismiss the Complaint with prejudice as it does not set forth a claim upon which relief can be granted, and requests such other relief as the Commission deems just, equitable, and proper.

Respectfully submitted, this the 24th day of June, 2022.

Robert W. Koyla

Robert W. Kaylor Law Office of Robert W. Kaylor, P.A. 353 E. Six Forks Road, Suite 260 Raleigh, NC 27609 919.828.5250 bkaylor@rwkaylorlaw.com State Bar No. 6237

ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT, DUKE ENERGY CAROLINAS, LLC

STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA COUNTY OF HENDERSON

GENERAL COURT OF JUSTICE SUPERIOR COURT DIVISION CIVIL ACTION 10 -CVS- 1058

DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION,
Plaintiff.

FILED

COMPLAINT

WILLIAM RHETT TABER, III and ANDREW PATTON TABER, as Co-Trustees of the Trust under the Will of Anne E Taber, and COUNTY, C.S.C. WILLIAM RHETT TABER, JR.,

Defendants.

Now comes the Department of Transportation, plaintiff herein, and for its cause of action says and alleges:

That the Department of Transportation is an agency of the State of North Carolina with its principal office in Raleigh, North Carolina; and that it possesses the powers, duties and authority, including the power of eminent domain, vested in it by the General Assembly of North Carolina.

2.

That pursuant to the authority vested in the plaintiff under the provisions of Chapter 136 of the General Statutes, and pursuant to a resolution of the Board of Transportation duly passed, it is necessary to condemn and appropriate certain property described in Exhibit "B", attached hereto, and made a part hereof, for public use in the construction of that certain highway project described in Exhibit "C" attached hereto and made a part hereof.

3.

That the plaintiff and the defendants have been unable to agree as to the purchase price of the property herein appropriated.

4.

That the property which is the subject of this action, the interest or estate acquired, and the area appropriated are all described in said Exhibit "B".

5.

That the plaintiff is informed and believes, and alleges upon information and belief, that those persons whose names and addresses are set forth in Exhibit "A", attached hereto and made a part hereof, are, insofar as the same can, by reasonable diligence, be ascertained, the only persons who may have or who claim to have an interest or estate in the property described in said Exhibit "B", and that said named persons are under no legal disability except as may be stated in said Exhibit "A".

6.

That the plaintiff is informed and believes, and alleges upon information and belief that said property is subject only to such liens and encumbrances as are set forth in Exhibit "A", attached hereto.

7.

That the plaintiff be granted a trial by jury on the issue of just compensation.

WHEREFORE, plaintiff prays that just compensation for the appropriation herein set forth be determined according to the provisions and procedures contained in Article 9 of Chapter 136 of the General Statutes and for such other relief as to the Court may seem just and proper.

JOSHUA H. STEIN Attorney General

Project No.

34232.2.5

Parcel No. 038

I.D. No. I-4400C

A.G. FILE NO. TR-19-00357

/s/ E. BURKE HAYWOOD

Special Deputy Attorney General

/s/ LISA B. FINKELSTEIN

Assistant Attorney General North Carolina Department of Justice 1505 Mail Service Center Raleigh, North Carolina 27699-1505

Telephone No. (919) 707-4480

JUL 2 6 2019

RIGHT OF WAY BRANC

EXHIBIT "A" Page 2

This document presented and filed: 07/15/2019 09:34:31 AM

WILLIAM LEE KING, Henderson COUNTY, NC

Prepared By/Return To: Lisa B. Finkelstein, Assistant Attorney General
N.C. Department of Transportation, Attorney General's Office
1505 Mail Service Center, Raleigh, N.C. 27699-1505

NORTH CAROLINA HENDERSON COUNTY

DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION, Plaintiff,

v

MEMORANDUM OF ACTION (G.S. 136-104)

WILLIAM RHETT TABER, III and ANDREW PATTON TABER, as Co-Trustees of the Trust under the Will of Anne F. Taber; and WILLIAM RHETT TABER, JR. Defendants.

Take Notice:

- 1. That on or about the 15th day of July, 2019, the Department of Transportation, under the provisions of Article 9, Chapter 136 of the General Statutes, instituted the above-captioned civil action in the Superior Court of Henderson County by the filing of a Complaint and Declaration of Taking and by the issuance of summons; that pursuant to G.S. 136-104, the interest and area specified in said Complaint and Declaration of Taking vested in the Department of Transportation on said date.
- 2. That the above-named defendants are the persons who the Department is informed and believes may have or claim to have an interest in said lands.

Project No.: 34232.2.5 Parcel No.: 038 I.D. No.: I-4400C

A.G. FILE NO. TR-19-00357

Book 3358 Page 322

3. That the property which is the subject of this action is described as follows:

Those certain lands lying and being in the Hoopers Creek Township, Henderson County, North Carolina, and being more particularly described as follows:

Being that land described in a Warranty Deed dated October 14, 2004 to William Rhett Taber, III and Andrew Patton Taber, as Co-Trustees of the Trust under the Will of Anne F. Taber, deceased, describing approximately 9.15 acres, and recorded November 8, 2004 in Book 1205, Page 131, Henderson County Registry. The property description contained in said deed is hereby incorporated by reference.

LESS AND EXCEPTING any and all out conveyances of record, if any.

Also, being that vacant land identified as Tax PIN No. 9651-57-5746 (REID No. 700725) containing approximately 9.810 acres as is shown in the Henderson County Tax Office.

More specifically, the tract of land affected by the taking in this condemnation action is a portion of the land identified as Tax PIN No. 9651-57-5746 and is an 8.00 acre piece of land situate on the north side of US 25 (Asheville Highway) to the southeast of its intersection with I-26 and just north of its intersection with Naples Road at the southern boundary of Fletcher, NC.

4. That the estate or interest acquired in or across said lands taken are described in Exhibit "B" of said Complaint and Declaration of Taking.

This the 11th day of July, 2019.

JOSHUA H. STEIN Attorney General

E. Burke Haywood

Elbusker

Special Deputy Attorney General

Project No.: 34232.2.5 Parcel No.: 038 I.D. No.: I-4400C

A.G. FILE NO. TR-19-00357

USP: NAPLE RET 1205 65201205 Safety Reminders / Adverse Conditions Work Zone General Comments: USP: NAPLES RET 4370 SAFETYFIE FLAGGING REQUIRED DUE TO LANE CLOSURE____ USP: 158 CO RD. 1533 HENDERSONVILLE, NC 28791 ?: ***GIS PRIORITY POSTING***
7: PHASING HAS NOT BEEN VERIFIED USP: NAPLES OCB D ACTIVE CARING P HAZARD RECOGNICIO USP: 7: VERIFY PHASING BEFORE ENERGIZING REMEMBER: Work zone area conditions may have changed for this job! Everyone is responsible for verifying the above safety information is correct prior to any work being performed each day. RELOCATING DUKE FACILITIES DUE *** ATTENTION*** THIS JOB CONTAINS GIS PRIORITY POSTINGS
FOLLOW GIS PRIORITY POSTING PROCESSES FOR FIELD TECHS.
RADIO THE DISPATCHER IMMEDIATELY AFTER NEW INSTALLATION. TO WIDENING ASHEVILLE HWY RELOCATION OR REMOVAL OF REGULATORS, RECLOSERS, CAPACITORS, SECTIONALIZERS OR ANY OTHER 3ØSWITCHING DEVICES. CHANGE IN WIRE SIZE, PHASING OR LOAD TRANSFERS. UNDERGROUND PERMANENT LOAD INSTALLATION, REMOVAL ENERGIZING, DE-ENERGIZING OF BACKBONE COMPLETION OF ANY SECTIONALIZATION PROJECT *** PHASING HAS NOT BEEN VERIFIED *** CHARGING WID'S P13 55/3 1LGD69 Existing- Grade B X- ARM OK Active Install MX7817975-I Active Remove-MX7817975-R Active Transfer MX7817975-X P14 50/3 Pole **CONSTRUCTION NOTES:** INSTALL 3.856' OF 336, INSTALL 394' OF 1/0 15 50/3 & INSTALL 239' 1/0 TPX REMOVE 3,836' OF 336, REMOVE 342' #2 & REMOVE 282' OF 1/0 TPX 16 50/3 Pole House Misses A runn 40 DE Share Sent P17 50/3 Pole P18 50/3 Pole FID 188671772 BØ P19 45/4 1LGD75 Existing Work Order Number 27817975 P6 55/3 Pole 1LGD61 7" Angle FID: 38671764 AØ, FID: 38671766 ABCØ CustomerContact 14400C-Sheet 5 and 45 P12 55/3 1LGD88***GRADE B CONSTRUCTION** Pole existing X- ARM OK Contact Phone Job Site Artriess 30 DE (336) HENDERSONVILLE P28 55/3 Pole 1LGD84 FBG ARM 30 DDE (336) FBG ARM 30 DE TAP (1/0) 10 DE TAP (#2) City 8 WD X-ARM 3Ø TI (336) HENDERSON County P29 55/3 Pole 1LGD85 21* Angle ***GRADE B CONSTRUCTION*** NC. 28792 3335760 (LOSE 21 Muje S 10 FBG DE ARM 30 DDE (336) (1) 10 DE TAP (#2) (1) 10 DE TAP (#2) (1) 10 FUS (80T) (1) 10 FUS (80T) (1) SGL DGUY (15° GL) (1) SGL SGUY 10° P11 50 KVA TX (80° OALUGTPX SVC) (2) 23 TPX 50° C State, Zip Ovidiu Babici P7 45/4 Pale 1LGD82 Designer 864-510-3779 (1) DEL SGLY SUN PO 5 P8 55/3 1LGD63 Existing P40 55/3 Pole 1LGD93 65201205 1112/3 TPX SEC WO X ARM 3CI TL (3 M) Circuit 10 12.47/ 7.2 KV P41 55/3 Pole 1LGD94 31' Andre P2 55/3 Pole Primary Voltage 8" FBG DE-ARM 30 DOE (\$36) Perryt Redures P10 55/3 Pale 23° Anglo FID. 3867 1770 CØ P42 55/3 Pole 1LGD95 \$ 55/3 FIR 38671760 ABCØ E 55/3 L 8" WD X-ARM 30" TL (336) L 10" FBG DE-ARM 30" DE TAP (130) E (1) 10" DE (#2) E (1) DBL DGLY (30" GL) I (1) 10" PUSE (65K) Permit Type/No. 3 P43 40/5 1LGD56 Easting P11 45/4 Pole 1LGD67 (1) 7/3 IPx SEC **DUKE** ENERGY. Steet 1 of 2 Scale = 1"=60" 16 TL (#2) (1) SGL SGUV from P29 (1) SGL DGUV (20' GL)

Docket No. E-7, Sub 1270

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of Duke Energy Carolinas, LLC's Motion to Dismiss Complaint has been served by hand delivery or by depositing a copy in the United States Mail, first class postage prepaid, properly addressed to:

Rhett Tabor 2028 Fairview Road Raleigh, NC 27608

This the 24th day of June, 2022.

Robert W. Kayla

Robert W. Kaylor
Law Office of Robert W. Kaylor, P.A.
353 E. Six Forks Road, Suite 260
Raleigh, NC 27609
919.828.5250
bkaylor@rwkaylorlaw.com
State Bar No. 6237

ATTORNEY FOR RESPONDENT, DUKE ENERGY CAROLINAS, LLC